



## A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF MORAL DEVELOPMENT OF STUDENTS FROM PRIVATE SCHOOLS AND MADRASSAHS

**Abdul Majid Khan Rana**, Incharge, (HoD) Department of Islamic Education, IER, University of the Punjab  
**Rana Navid Ahmad**, Associate professor, Govt College of Science, Wahdat road, Lahore  
**Shafiq ur Rehman**, Assistant Professor, Institute of Education and Research (IER), University of the Punjab

**ABSTRACT:** Morality and ethics had been a center of attention of philosophers, educationists, sociologists, policymakers, parents and various school systems. They all have discussed the moral development. Major objective of study is to investigate the moral development of students of Private schools and Madrassahs of Pakistan. Two Hypotheses developed were developed. It was a descript research and survey method was used to collect the data. In the first phase three schools and three Madrassahs were selected by using proportionate stratified sampling technique and in second phase, by convenient sampling technique 100 students (25 each) from 9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> class from private schools and Darja Aama and Darja khasa from Madrassahs. A comprehensive Urdu version of self developed questionnaire having 26 statements collection on five points Likert scale was used for survey. It comprises of six aspects of Moral values as Honesty, Respect for Elders, and Love for Younger, Patriotism, Mannerism and Extremism. The data is analyzed using frequencies, mean scores and standard deviation for finding the significant mean differences. The results of study showed that students of private schools are morally more developed as compared with Madrassah students.

**Keywords:** Moral Development, Private School, Madrassah, Honesty

### I. INTRODUCTION

One of the main aspects of personality is character. It is very importance in life of every human being. Good people of society stand with good character and goodness. Leming (1994) suggested the role of school, as the chief agent of providing and transmitting the social values and has a key role to play in developing the moral ethics in students with the essential intellectual, emotional, social and moral training (p.123).

It is the elemental belief among societies that education is the medium of social change and reform. Philosophers as well as scientists increasingly showed their interest in studying moral behavior, focusing on understanding *individual differences* in obedience, social behavior, sympathy, and moral development in members of society. Moral behavior of individuals gives to the systematic consideration of moral conduct, moral cognition and moral affect.

Maududi (1948) in his book, *'The ethical viewpoint of Islam,'* translated by Khursheed Ahmed has rational this commonality of universal values and ethics. The following quotation from his book is important to be included in this review to understand the nature of universal values as "Moral sense is inborn in man and through the ages it has served as the common man's standard of moral behavior, approving certain qualities and disapproving others. While this instinctive faculty may vary from person to person, human conscience has given a more or less uniform verdict in favor of certain moral qualities as being good and declared certain others as bad".

Moral development is a process through which a person knows about taking decisions about good and bad (Kohlberg, 1984). Moral education is one of the basics of school life. A character building is main objective of Education and has been emphasized by some educationists like, Power (1997), Dewey (1934). Moral education has been considered a means for the determined teaching of values, mannerism and spirit of social behavior (Oser, 1996; Hansen, 2001). Many have acknowledged 'Education' as a 'moral activity' (Noddings, 1992; Sockett, 1993, and Tom, 1984).

Freud (1930), Piaget (1932) and Skinner (1956), said that morality is a social cognitive trend through which a person develops the concept of right and wrong in the context of social interaction. Kohlberg (1976)

presented a distinct developmental theory of moral development summing up the ideas given by the modern psychologists. According to Kohlberg (1984), moral development is a process of knowing about good and right. Finally, he concluded that moral development composed of three levels, consisting of six stage process of thinking over time. Pre conventional to Conventional and then Post conventional as: “Pre- conventional level: 1. Avoiding punishment; 2. A simple exchange of interests, Conventional level: 3. Interpersonal harmony and compliance; 4. Law and order, Conventional level: 5. Social contract; 6. Universal moral principles. Leming (1994) has supported the role of school, as the chief agent of providing and transforming the social values and performed a key role in developing the ethical values in students with the intellectual, emotional, social and moral training (p.123).

Now a day in Pakistan, education is provided by three means like Public schools, Madrassah and Private schools. Moral values are considered as a primary goal of education, and it is a primary responsibility of these institutions to facilitate such education. It is clearly mentioned in The Pakistan Education Conference (1947) that the educational institutions educating citizens. To achieve this objective, it would be “practiced and guided” by the Islamic principles of “universal brotherhood of man, social democracy and social justice’ and the democratic virtues of tolerance, self-help, self-sacrifice.”(Education Division, 1947, p.5).

Under Pakistan National Education Policy (2009) all school systems have to provide equal opportunities to the students. Hoodbhoy (2004) suggested that the ratio of students in institutions is as Public schools 73%, Private Schools 26% and Madrassahs 1 %. He further viewed that educational system of Pakistan has failed to impart values and skills to students. According to 18<sup>th</sup> constitutional amendment, education is a prime responsibility of provinces. Owing to fund shortages, poor send their children to Madrassah rather to Public Schools. The failures of Public Sector are moving toward Madrassahs.

Jennings (2006) regarded courage, honesty, self- control, integrity and respect for humans and non-humans as five important moral values. Basic human and religious values including the aim of Moral education is to enhance children personality, to become disciplined, successful nation and ethically responsible with good character. These values can only be learned through Education. Despite the fact that almost all religious subjects of Madrassahs are being taught in our schools but moral behavior of students is not accepted because of continuous modifications and eliminations in the syllabus of Islamic studies and many other subjects (Birsch, 2002).The purpose of the current research is to compare the moral development of students of Private schools and Madrassah.

## II. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

It is a descriptive research design. A survey method was used for comparing two educational sectors private schools and Madrassahs. Two layer sampling technique was used to collect data. Islamia model high school Multan Road Lahore as private school and Madrassah Fatima tu Zahra Madrassah were selected as sample. The sample consisted of 100 students’ i.e.25 each from 9<sup>th</sup>, 10<sup>th</sup> class from private schools and 25 each from Derja Aama and Derja Khasa from Madrassahs using convenient sampling technique.

On the basis of related literature, a comprehensive self developed questionnaire having 26 statements on five points Likert scale was used for survey. Urdu version of the questionnaire was administered as it was easy for the students of Madrassahs and students of Secondary level of private schools. It comprises of six factors of Moral values as Honesty, Respect for Elders, Love for younger, Patriotism, Mannerism and Extremism. These factors were composed of various statements. Table gives the details of statements.

Table: Details of various moral factors along with statements

Sr. No	Factors	No. of statements
01	Honesty	04
02	Respect for elders	04

03	Love for younger	03
04	Patriotism	05
05	Mannerism	05
06	Extremism	05
<b>Total</b>		<b>26</b>

### III. RESULTS AND FINDINGS

the data was analyzed by comparing two groups by calculating frequency of every statement and then comparing their Mean differences between groups by using paired samples t-test.

S. No	Statement	Institute	Mean	SD
1		Pvt School	4.86	.351
		Madrassah	3.88	1.814
2		Pvt School	3.88	1.409
		Madrassah	4.30	.866
3		Pvt School	4.78	.582
		Madrassah	4.72	.454
4		Pvt School	4.32	.471
		Madrassah	4.44	.907
5		Pvt School	1.98	.144
		Madrassah	2.42	1.401
6		Pvt School	1.80	.639
		Madrassah	2.28	.454
7		Pvt School	3.66	1.533
		Madrassah	2.00	.756
8		Pvt School	3.20	1.050
		Madrassah	3.58	1.180
9		Pvt School	4.54	.838
		Madrassah	4.00	.756
10		Pvt School	2.62	1.550
		Madrassah	3.44	1.053
11		Pvt School	3.98	1/301
		Madrassah	4.86	.351
12		Pvt School	4.98	.141
		Madrassah	4.00	.926
13		Pvt School	4.36	1.225
		Madrassah	3.16	1.646
14		Pvt School	4.16	.370
		Madrassah	3.58	1.180

15	چٹی بین آپکی کتاب پھاڑ دے تو اسے مارنا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	4.14 4.16	.639 .997
16	چھ سے زیادہ شہادت کرنا انہیں بگاڑ دینا ہے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	1.00 2.74	.000 1.759
17	کسی کے گھر داخل ہونے سے پہلے دروازہ ضرور کھٹکھٹائیں۔	Pvt School Madrasah	2.30 2.28	1.147 1.031
18	کھانا کھاتے وقت موبائل کا استعمال نہیں کرنا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	2.08 2.42	1.368 1.679
19	چلتے وقت ہمیشہ اسٹانڈ کے ہوجھے چلنا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	3.40 1.98	1.107 1.317
20	کھانے سے پہلے ہاتھ دھونا الزم نہیں کھانا ہے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	2.56 3.88	1.445 1.3651
21	میں اپنے کمرے کی صفائی کا خیال خود رکھنا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	1.32 1.86	.471 .639
22	مسلم گنیمت کے لیے بات چیت کے بجائے اڑتیا سے جھگڑنا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	3.36 3.00	1.535 1.604
23	بچے کے فروغ کے لیے لڑکے لڑکیوں کا ایک ساتھ پڑھنا جائز عمل ہے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	4.14 4.40	.756 .756
24	عورتوں کو بڑھا کر مردوں کے برابر کام کرنے کا موقع ملنا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	1.78 3.72	.790 1.031
25	عورتوں کو ووٹ ڈالنے کا حق نہیں ہونا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	4.22 3.44	.737 1.680
26	پردہ کو ہر صورت عورتوں پر الزم گزار دینا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	3.70 2.86	1.249 1.442
6	قومی ترانے کے احترام میں پرکام چھوڑ کر کھڑے ہوجانا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	1.80 2.28	.639 .454
7	قومی جھنڈے کو کوڑے میں پھینک دینا کوئی بڑی بات نہیں ہے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	3.66 2.00	1.533 .756
8	ملک پر جان نثار کرنا صرف فوج کا حق ہے، کیونکہ وہ استخراہ لیتے ہیں۔	Pvt School Madrasah	3.20 3.58	1.050 1.180
9	میں سفر کرتے وقت بعد میں آنے والے بزرگ کو سیٹ نہیں دینی چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	4.54 4.00	.838 .756
10	جلدی میں ہونے کے باوجود ضعیف شخص کو سڑک پار کروانی چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	2.62 3.44	1.550 1.053
11	والدہ کے کہنے کے باوجود اپنا پسندیدہ کھانا چھوڑے بہابی کو نہیں دینا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	3.98 4.86	1/301 .351
12	بچوں پر تشدد کرنا درست عمل ہے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	4.98 4.00	.141 .926
13	مارکیٹوں میں مانگنے والے بچوں کو پیسے نہیں دینے چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	4.36 3.16	1.225 1.646
14	گھر میں کام کرنے والے بچے کو چوری کرنے پر حوالہ پولیس کرنا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	4.16 3.58	.370 1.180
15	چھوٹی بین آپکی کتاب پھاڑ دے تو اسے مارنا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	4.14 4.16	.639 .997
16	بچوں سے زیادہ شفقت کرنا انہیں بگاڑ دینا ہے۔	Pvt School Madrasah	1.00 2.74	.000 1.759

17	کسی کے گھر داخل ہونے سے پہلے دروازہ ضرور کھٹکھٹائیں۔	Pvt School Madrassah	2.30 2.28	1.147 1.031
18	کہنا کہتے وقت موبائل کا استعمال نہیں کرنا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrassah	2.08 2.42	1.368 1.679
19	چلتے وقت ہمیشہ استاذہ کے پیچھے چلنا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrassah	3.40 1.98	1.107 1.317
20	کہتے سے پہلے ہاتھ دھونا الزم نہیں کہنا ہے۔	Pvt School Madrassah	2.56 3.88	1.445 1.3651
21	اپنے کمرے کی صفائی کا خیال خود رکھنا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrassah	1.32 1.86	.471 .639
22	مسئلہ کشمیر کے لیے بات چیت کے بجائے انتہا سے جنگ کرنی چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrassah	3.36 3.00	1.535 1.604
23	تعلیم کے فروغ کے لیے لڑکے لڑکیوں کا ایک ساتھ پڑھنا جائز عمل ہے۔	Pvt School Madrassah	4.14 4.40	.756 .756
24	عورتوں کو پڑھا کر مردوں کے برابر کام کرنے کا موقع ملنا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrassah	1.78 3.72	.790 1.031
25	عورتوں کو ووٹ ڈالنے کا حق نہیں ہونا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrassah	4.22 3.44	.737 1.680
26	پردہ کو ہر صورت عورتوں پر الزم قرار دینا چاہیے۔	Pvt School Madrassah	3.70 2.86	1.249 1.442

In 11 statements (1,3,7,9,10,12,14,20,24,25,26) Private School students have more developed moral values as compared with Madrassah students. In 7 statements only (2 5, 6, 8, 13, 16, 19) Madrassah students have more developed moral values as compared with students of private schools. In 8 statements ( 4,11,15,17,18,21,22,23 ) students of both groups Private and Madrassah students have same and equal moral values.

So the conclusion is that private school students have more developed moral values as compare to Madrassah students. The Private sector students performed well and achieved better level of morality than that of students studying in Madrassah. The students of Private sector were more morally developed than that of Madrassah students.

**Table: Mean and standard deviations to examine the effects of different systems on various factors of moral values**

Private schools	Madrassahs					
	N	M	SD	M	SD	
<b>Moral value</b>						
<b>Honesty</b>	100	17.48	1.448	17.34	3.750	
<b>Patriotism</b>	100	10.64	2.694	10.28	2.051	
<b>Respect for elders</b>	100	11.14	1.414	12.30	1.488	
<b>Love for younger</b>	100	18.64	1.439	17.64	5.598	
<b>Mannerism</b>	100	11.66	3.868	12.42	3.333	
<b>Extremism</b>	100	17.20	3.399	17.42	5.261	

The above table shows the mean value of sum of all statements of Honesty, Patriotism, Respect for elders, Love for younger, Mannerism and Extremism from both private school and Madrassah. According to above table

- Four Statements of honesty shows that private school students have more moral values as compare to Madrassah students.

- Four statements of Patriotism shows that private school students have less moral values as compare to Madrassah students.
- Three statements of Respect for elder's shows that private school students have more inclined towards moral values as compare to Madrassah students.
- Five statements of Love for Younger's shows that private school students and Madrassah students have equal moral values
- Five statements of Mannerism shows that private school students and Madrassah students have equal moral values.
- five statements of Extremism shows that private school students have more moral values as compare to Madrassah students

#### IV. DISCUSSION

The character building of students is the most ideal task of educational institutions. As discussed in review of educational policies, the main intention of the Madrassahs is to prepare morally ideal citizens who could live a peaceful life and have better relationships with other fellows at national and international level, while it is found that students of Private schools showed high moral development. The other side of the picture is that it is evident from the research that children studying in Madrassahs had lowest moral development.

The study negated one of the previous research findings by Khanam (2010) who found that students of Madrassahs showed better morality in adolescence as compared to students of private school. The religious activities are performed without understanding. Translation of Quran is introduced at the last stage when the students' behavior becomes set. The study supports here the previous research (Khanam, 2010) that teaching Quran without understanding makes no significant difference in the moral development of students. The other factors may be low socio-economic status, less social interaction with media and people which develops low understanding of the teachings of the religion.

The students with better moral development may prove nonviolent, cooperative, social, supportive and kind to others. They can develop good relationships with other members of society. Therefore moral education should be included and give emphasis at all levels of education to improve societal thoughts.

#### V. CONCLUSION

It is concluded from the above findings that institutions of all types had distinct influence on the moral development of students. The students of Private schools showed better moral values than that of students Madrassah. The study revealed that institutions providing more opportunities of sociability and information provided better values as compare to institutions with less sociability, information and infrastructure.

#### VI. RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the findings of this research, following recommendations have been framed.

- The curriculum and syllabi should be revised for moral output. Learning out comes may be incorporated with affective domain.
- Respect may be the necessary part of the culture of institutions.
- Learning of Moral values with various activities and games should be the part of learning at Madrassahs, and Private.
- Understanding of the content may be the part of Lesson planning for students.
- Teachers may construct helpful learning environment for moral values. They should discuss real life situations with students for right and wrong.
- Guidance and counseling sessions should be conducted for moral development in the schools.
- Mentoring should be the part of educational institutions to inculcate moral values.
- Teachers may act as role models for developing character building.

- Strong student teacher relationship may prove key for promoting moral behavior.
- Students should be provided opportunities of social services so that they can understand the ground realities of their society.

### FUTURE RESEARCH SUGGESTIONS

On the basis of the results of the present study it is suggested that, a comparative study on the moral development of the students on various models of education in Pakistan” may be conducted to discover the clear phenomena of moral development and to get real image of the issue. A study of the moral development of the students of Universities, Colleges and Schools may also be helpful.

### REFERENCES

1. Ahmed, S. (2017). Stylistic analysis the English translations of Surah Rehman: A comparative study of multiple sources. *Al-Qalam*, 22(1), 458-467.
2. Birsch, D. (2002). *Ethical insights; A brief introduction* (2nd ed). New York. McGraw Hill.
3. Dewey, J. (1934). *A common faith*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press
4. Hoodbhoy, P.(2004) *Pakistani schools and not just madrassas*: Quaid-i-Azam University; Islamabad.
5. Jensen, L. A. (1997). *Different worldviews, different morals: America's culture war divide*. Human Development 40:325-344.
6. Kohlberg, L. (1976). Moral stages and moralisation: The cognitive developmental approach. In T. Lickona (Ed.), *Moral development and behaviour: Theory, research and social issues*. (pp. 31-53). New York: Holt Rineheart and Winston
7. Kohlberg, L. (1984). *The psychology of moral development: Essays on moral development* (Vol. 2). New York: Harper & Row.
8. Lapsley, D. K. (1996). *Moral psychology*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
9. Leming, C. J. (1994). Character education and multicultural education: conflicts and prospects. Educational Horizons 72
10. Maududi, A.A. (1948). *The ethical viewpoint of Islam*. Retrieved February 20, 2012 from <http://www.islam101.com/sociology/socialOrder.htm>.
11. Ahmed, S. N., Abbas, F. & Naz, F. (2020). Historical development of orthography in English and impact of computer-mediated communication (CMC) on the emerging orthographic patterns in English. *PalArch's Journal of Archeology of Egypt* 17(11), 162-175.
12. Abbas, F., Jalil, M. K., Zaki, H. N. & Irfan, F. (2020). Implicit measure of language attitude: study of Punjabi native speakers by using matched guise technique. *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change*, 13 (1), 194-206.
13. Ahmed, S., Abbas, F., Jalil, M. K. & Ahmad, M. (2019) Language Anxiety as a Detrimental Factor in English Language Learning: A Survey of Religious Madaris. *Al Qalam*, 24 (2), 346-363.
14. Oser, F. K. (1996) Trust in advance: on the professional morality of teaching, *Journal of Moral Education*, 22(3), 255-276.
15. Piaget, J. (1932). *The moral judgment of the child*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul Skinner, B. F. (1956). *Science and human behaviour*. New York: Free Press.
16. Sockett, H. (1993). *The moral base for teacher professionalism*. New York: Teachers Tom, A. (1984). *Teaching as a moral craft*. New York: Longman Press.