Ilkogretim Online - Elementary Education Online, 2020; Vol 19 (Issue 3): pp. 2555-2562 http://ilkogretim-online.org

doi: 10.17051/ilkonline.2020.03.735415

INFLUENCE OF ORGANIZATIONAL JUSTICE ON TEACHERS' PERFORMANCE IN HEIs: MEDIATING ROLE OF ORGANIZATIONAL POLITICS

Shaukat Ullah Khan, PhD Scholar, Department of Public Administration, Gomal University, Dera Ismail Khan, Pakistan Dr. Farhat Ullah Khan, Department of Business Administration, Gomal University, Dera Ismail Khan, Pakistan Sana Gul, Lecturer, Department of English Literature & Linguistics, Riphah International University, Islamabad Mati Ullah Khan, PhD Scholar, Institute of Education & Research, Gomal University, Dera Ismail Khan, KP, Pakistan Dr. Asghar Ullah Khan, PhD in Mass Communication from Department of Communication & Media Studies, Dera Ismail Khan

ABSTRACT- The fairness in institutional procedures and processes is significant predictor for various outcomes of the institutions that are directly related with the institutional standing, ranking and success. The- fairness is important forecaster for the decent performances as and when the teachers feel that fairness is respected in the concerned institutions then efforts and achievements level of the concerned teachers is expected to be at peak. The existing literature revealed the positive and significant association between organizational justice and teachers' performance however, the existing research also provide the hints that this relationship is expected to be influenced by many factors among which organizational politics is foremost. In this connection, this study is an effort to examine the mediating role of the politics in relationships between organizational justice and teachers' performance. The data was collected from faculty members from higher institutions on KP, Pakistan and analyzed through statistical procedures, based upon the objectives of study to reach the conclusion. The study provides significant results in reaching conclusion and offering certain recommendations.

Keywords: Organizational Justice, Organizational Politics, Teachers' Performance & HEIs

I. INTRODUCTION

The education is the matter of priority for the developed and developing countries wherein various issues and trends have been evident as associated with the credibility of the quality education. In the educational context, various issues have been continuously explored thereby keeping in view the leading and burning challenges confronted by educational sector (Bhawna & Hatwal, 2018). The existing research offered various literature on issues related with teaching and administrative workforces which are explored in research study (Othman, Mokhtar & Asaad, 2017). However, this study is mainly focused upon the examination of view of teaching faculties concerning the various issues like culture, justice, empowerment, politics and performance parameters (Markos, Sang & Muthanna, 2019). The existing research also offered various literature on other issues in the similar context that need additional examination in abovementioned context. The organizational justice, in the educational setting, denoted to the just, fair and transparent decisions on part of management and leadership towards their workforces. When the concerned teachers perceive that they are treated equally in the institutions without any discriminations then they will show utmost commitment and performance to achieve desired standards and success of institutions (Tahseen & Akhtar, 2015).

The fair decisions on the part of leaders will be supportive in nurturing commitment, trust and performances of teachers which in order will assist the institutions in attaining the competitive edge in modern competitive situation (Khan, Shukor & Ismail, 2016). The organizational justice is the combination of certain imperative attributes of fairness in which distributive, procedural and interactional dimensions are most critical and when followed effectively by institutions then leads higher level of teachers' performances. The teachers' performance and fairness perception have direct relationships as evidenced in the existing literature. The organizational justice has been considered are the critical issue in shaping the behavior of teachers (Ogbonna & Harris, 2005). When the teachers realize that they are treated fairly in institutions as per institutional norms and values then teachers will show undaunted commitment and wholehearted performance to attain institutional long-term objectives (Oluseyi & Ayo, 2009). Conversely, when teachers feel that they are not treated equally, then the concerned teachers will show their serious concerns about the impartiality on part of institution which in turn affect their performance at workplaces (Paracha, Qamar, Mirza & Waqas, 2012).

Therefore, the supportive culture and prevailing justice are the significant predictors towards the best performances of the teachers in higher institutions. The higher education also witnessed the politics within institutions that brings along certain dark as well as bright sides and magnitudes for the higher institutions. The politics is thus influence for the authority and control that is associated with the smooth functioning of institutional activities and practices and thus influences performances of the teachers as well as the institutions (Cheng & Chia, 2017). The institutions are thus responsible for catering the situations related with the culture, justice, empowerment, politics and performance in context of the higher education in order to address these issues in traditional manners thereby applying advanced techniques to reach the concluding the research (Azizi, Mohammad & Hassani, 2011) with certain production of new facts as well as the figures about the vitality and consequences of these issues in context of higher education in developing countries like Pakistan.

Problem Statement

The organizational justice is the significant contributor towards various organizational outcomes among which the performance is the most leading phenomenon. The performance is thus solely responsible for success and failure of all organizations including higher educational institutions. In this connection, this study is an attempt to examine the role of organizational justice in teachers' performance along with the mediating role of organizational politics in connecting the predicting as well as criterion variables. The study aimed to conduct in the higher educational context with the expectations to attain the desired outcomes thereby providing suitable addition towards the related information to existing database of knowledge about the issues under considerations to explore these issues from different dimensions.

Objectives & Hypotheses

- 1. To examine the association between predicting and mediating variables (organizational justice & organizational politics) as well as the criterion variable (teachers' performance) (hypothesis # 1).
- 2. To examine mediating role of organizational politics in relationship between organizational justice and teachers' performance in the context of higher education in KP, Pakistan (hypothesis # 2).

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

The higher education in developed countries as more overwhelmed with education development as these countries are focused upon the development of strategies and plans that are required for the educational development in letters and spirit (Yielder & Codling, 2004). The higher education is also significant for improving the academic standards of institutions as the education imparted at higher level should meet required standards for improving individuals' status and developing professional standing (Akhter & Sharif, 2012). The teachers' leadership and management role is also critical in determining the institutional ranking and desired success (Walker & Boni, 2014). In higher education institutions, vice chancellors are considered as nucleus of authority, influence and control along with administrative functionaries to meet academic and administrative affairs. The higher education encompasses hierarchy about different units (teaching & administrative) wherein teaching faculty is responsible for upbringing academic standards while administrative units are responsible for upbringing administrative standards in the concerned institutions (Haider & Sultan, 2008). In this regard, existing literature offered various insights to issues and challenges related with teaching faculties related with academic standards along with the evidences related with the challenges confronted by the management and the administration of higher educational institutions (Mace, & Niazi, 2006).

In this connection, the research is still active upon the exploration of various challenges related with the teaching and administrative spheres in the higher education (Thornton & Audrey, 2008). The identification of these problems and utilizations of various resources to cater to the situation is the main challenge for higher institution. Institutional management needs to have strong comprehension about the institutional impediments and parameters that are important for managing the desired situations. In this connection, the institutions need to revisit their policies and strategies concerning the entire working format as well as the development in the curriculum and infrastructure towards the development of the education at higher levels (Haider & Sultan, 2008). The institutions need to examine the existing realities that have been widely explored in connection to higher educations that are expected to influence the credibility of the higher institutions (Bhawna & Hatwal, 2018). In this regard, numerous critical and leading phenomena have been explored like leadership, organizational justice and culture, institutional support, institutional and teachers' performance, emotional as well as psychological intelligence and empowerment.

Organizational Justice

The organizational justice has been explored widely in higher educational context with the diverse outcomes as it not helps in maintaining the transparent standing of organizations in competitive markets but also helps in managing the demands of teachers towards their basic rights and responsibilities (Cremer, Dijke, & Bos, 2007). The organizational justice in the higher education has remained the phenomenon of greater importance which not only helps in ensuring basic criteria for measuring teachers' efforts (Douglas, & Haley, 2013) but also helps gauging organizational response for concerned teachers. The teachers and institutions are always bonded through the certain critical factors that further counts for persistent interactions (Eberlin, & Tatum, 2008) between both wherein responses towards altitudinal changes have been recorded and maintained and wherein tasks are prioritized based upon the critical situation (Hassan, & Hashim, 2011). The higher education has certain stakes in the contemporary competitive environment where many factors are responsible to measure situation as per desired standards (Hassan, & Hassan, 2015). Thus, the fairness in this connection becomes the more critical phenomenon that overwhelmed at linkages between employees and organizations. Thus, organizational justice is vital in managing institutional strategic objectives in diverse situations.

Organizational Politics

The higher education institutions, in contemporary era, are facing different problems which thus influences the credibility and success of higher institutions in diverse manners. In this connection, organizational politics has diverse effects on institutional performance and success (Hochwarter et al., 2020). The higher education institutions remained the victims of organizational politics in diverse situations which not only influences the institutional performance concerning teaching and learning activities (Kaya, Aydin, & Ongun, 2016) and practices but influences employees' perceptions about the fairness in the concerned institutions. The politics has critical influence on actions and practices of higher institution to effect institutional smooth functioning in uninvited manners (Hochwarter, & Thompson, 2010). Organizational politics consequently has significant impact on institutional development and success. The organizational politics is widely experiencing in the higher institutional context as it has been widely researched in the educational institutions with the diverse outcomes (Lampaki, & Papadakis, 2018). The public sector higher educational institutions are political institutions inherently as higher influences have been experienced in higher institutions (Khuwaja, Ahmed, Abid, & Adeel, 2020). Institutions significant control public possessions, have authority legitimate to public allocate benefits, significant political importance, and implement policies attitude as visible highly positions of public contest.

Teachers' Performance

The teachers' performance has been widely examined in the higher educational context with diverse outcomes as higher education has focused on importance of skills, knowledge, motivation and performance (Aryee, Chen, & Budhwar, 2004). The higher education has performed serious role in promotion of skills and knowledge thereby motivating teachers to perform their duties with the utmost dedication and commitment (Arman, Latif, & Ali, 2014). The higher education has thus remained the victim of performance issues during the last decades as the ranking of the institutions are directly related with the performance of the teachers (Devonish, & Greenidge, 2010). The employees have been considered as leading source for maintaining competitiveness in institutions which thus helps in sustaining institutional strong position and standing in competitive environment of competitive advantages (Ahmed, & Mostafa, 2017). The performance of teachers in higher education institutions are vital as the teachers are responsible for providing the effective teaching and learning facilities to students in making their future effective (Ali, & Musah, 2012). The institutional priorities also need the persistent support for the teachers and employees to show their commitment and the leading performances towards attainment of desired goals and tasks related with effectiveness of the higher educational institutions.

III. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The researcher aimed to explore existing realities (organizational culture, organizational justice, psychological empowerment, organizational politics & teachers' performance) in the native environment via diverse tools of statistics to examine the extent of relationships among these realities (variables) in particular context. Research design of current study comprises descriptive as well as empirical research scheme. In this connection, the research design is used when the researchers plan minutely every possible dimension of research like from problem identification to its presentation or communication (Creswell,

2007). The survey is thus recommended as the most sophisticated approach to access the population of the study under considerations. Thus, the total population of the study comprises 1418 faculty members who were the target population of present study. A sample of 312 was selected thus 312 questionnaires were distributed among which 300 were recollected. The data collection is also an important part of the social research studies because accurate and sufficient data is essential to produce systematic and reliable results/outcomes. The correlation, regression, mediation and test of significance tools have been applied to analyze primary data of the study and reaching the objectives. The questionnaire was adopted from the previous research studies as mentioned below:

- Organizational justice Greenberg (1990).
- Organizational politics Ferris (2002).
- teachers' performance, Uphoff and Muharir (1994).

IV. RESULTS OF STUDY

The results are the main outcomes that tells the entire story of research with regard to the answers of research questions (hypotheses) in order to reach the conclusion of study more systematically. The discussions help in making clear the positions of the research studies thereby validating the results through results of existing research studies in different as well as similar contexts. In this connection, in this section, the researcher offered the main results of the study as outcomes of the statistical procedures.

Tables 1 Descriptive Statistics

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	SD
Organizational Justice	300	1.78	6.45	4.0422	1.04981
Organizational Politics	300	1.61	6.10	3.5896	.91268
Teachers' Performance	300	1.77	7.00	4.3217	1.28007

Correlation Analysis

The correlation helps in providing the information about the association among research variables as hypothesized from the theoretical framework to examine the strength as well as the direction of association among the research variables. In this study, the researcher used the correlation to examine the association among research variables under considerations to examine the strength and direction in relationships.

H1: There is significant and positive association among Research Variables (independent, mediator and dependent).

Tables 2 Correlation Analysis

		Organizational Justice	Organizational Politics
Organizational Politics	Pearson Correlation	.360**	
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	
	N	300	
Teachers'	Pearson Correlation	.419**	321**
Performance	Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.000
	N	300	300

^{**.} Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

The association among research variables (predictor, mediator & criterion) were hypothesized through hypothesis # 1 in order to examine the strength and direction of association among the research variables. The correlation results confirmed association existence wherein significant and positive associations were found among criterion (teachers' performance), predicting variable (organizational justice) and mediating variable (organizational politics). The results show that teachers' performance is significantly and positively associated with organizational justice (R= .419 & P= .000), and organizational politics (R = -.321 & P = .000). Thus, from correlation results, H_1 is accepted. The results have been supported through the results of the existing research and thus validated (Aryee, Chen & Budhwar, 2004; Harris, Harris & Harvey, 2007; Khan, Abbas, Gul & Raja, 2015; Kalay & Van, 2016; Wang, Xia & Chang, 2010). Therefore, significant support has been provided to the results of study.

Mediation Analysis

The mediation is the process of examining the facilitating role of third variable in connecting the predictor and criterion variable of the study. In this connection, three mediation models have been extracted from the theoretical framework of the study which have been presented in this section. The mediation used to examine the mediating role of the mediator in connecting the independent and dependent variables under considerations in this research study.

 H_2 : Organizational politics "significantly mediates the relationship between organizational justice" and teachers' performance.

Mediation First Step (a)

Table 3 Model Summary

R	R Square	MSE	F	df1	df2	p
.5597	.3132	.4110	135.9118	1.0000	298.0000	.0000

Table 4 Coefficients of Regression

Model	Coefficient	se	t	р	LLCI	ULCI
Constant	.4520	.2845	1.5887	.1132	1079	1.0120
Organizational	.7197	.0617	11.6581	.0000	.5982	.8411
Justice						

Predicting Variable: Organizational Justice Criterion Variable: Organizational Politics

Mediation Second & Third Steps (b & ć)

Table 5 Model Summary

R	R Square	MSE	F	df1	df2	p
.7734	.5982	.4635	221.0646	2.0000	297.0000	.0000

Table 6 Coefficients of Regression

	- 0					
Model	Coefficient	se	t	р	LLCI	ULCI
Constant	3367	.3034	-1.1095	.2681	9338	.2605
Organizational Justice	.2351	.0791	1.9727	.0932	.0795	.3908
Organizational Politics	.9588	.0615	15.5866	.0000	.8377	1.0798

Predicting Variable: Organizational Justice, Organizational Politics

Criterion Variable: Teachers' Performance

Mediation Fourth Step (c)

Table 7 Model Summary

R	R Square	MSE	F	df1	df2	p
.5191	.2695	.8398	109.9327	1.0000	298.0000	.0000

Table 8 Coefficients of Regression

Model	Coefficient	se	t	р	LLCI	ULCI
Constant	.0968	.4067	.2379	.8121	7036	.8971
Organizational	.9251	.0882	10.4849	.0000	.7515	1.0987
Justice						

Predicting Variable: Organizational Justice Criterion Variable: Teachers' Performance

Table 9 Normal Theory Test (Sobel Test)

Effect	se	Z	p
.4212	.0242	5.2214	.0000

The hypothesis # 2 was about the organizational politics mediating role in relationship between organizational justice and teachers' performance that was hypothesized from the theoretical framework of present study. The results of mediation provided the information about all the conditions and paths wherein the first path (a) shows 31% variance in organizational politics is due to the organizational justice with significant coefficient and p-values (β = .7197 & P-value= .0000). The paths (b & ć) that represents the indirect relationships shows 60% change in the teachers' performance is due to organizational justice and organizational politics with significant coefficient and p-values likewise organizational justice (β = .2351 & P-value = .0932) and organizational politics (β = .9588 & P-value= .0000). Therefore, the three paths provided significant information about mediation procedure and thus decision need about direct relationship (c). The direct relationships show influence of independent variable (organizational justice) on criterion variable (teachers' performance) wherein 27% change is evident in teachers' performance is due to organizational justice.

Therefore, all the paths of mediations have provided significant information in deciding mediation. As, all paths remained significant in the mediation process, except organizational politics in the indirect relationship (.0932) therefore, the decision about the mediation need to be taken upon the coefficient values. The decrease in Beta from (.9251) in the direct relationship to (.2351) in the indirect relation after inclusion of organizational politics as mediator confirmed that relationship between organizational justice and teachers' performance is fully mediated. Therefore, the hypothesis (H₂) about the mediation model is therefore accepted and substantiated. These results, thus have been confirmed through the results of existing research studies which are similar to certain extent (Imran, Iqbal, Aslam & Muqadas, 2018; Bilal, Muqadas & Khalid, 2015; Hossei & Hassan, 2019; Samuel, Xiong & Budhwar, 2004; Wang, Liao, Xia & Chang 2010). In this connection, the organizational politics is critical in determining the connection between the organizational justice and teachers' work behavior. The politics within the institutions is the most significant aspect that not only influences the cultural and justice parameters but also influences the performances.

V. CONCLUSION

The researcher offered the conclusion based on the results of the research study from where the recommendations have been extracted followed by recommendations for future research along with implications and contributions of study. The research was based on certain hypotheses (assumptions, guidelines & tentative solutions), as extracted from the theoretical framework which were chased through statistical procedures to find the answers of research questions and to reach the conclusion. In this section, researcher offered research hypotheses along with their decisions (outcomes from the statistical procedures about possible/potential relationships) categorically to understand the nature, purpose, objectives and outcomes of research in order to conclude the study. The decisions are basically the inferences that the researcher extracted from the results of the study to make the decisions about each of the research hypothesis concerning with relationships among the research variables under considerations.

The H_1 was about the association among the research variables (predictors, mediator & criterion) by applying the correlation procedure. The results of the study confirmed the positive and significant association between the organizational culture, organizational justice, psychological empowerment, organizational politics and teachers' performance. the decisions about H1, from the results, is accepted based upon the outcomes from the correlation about the association. The H_2 was about the mediating role of organizational politics in relationship between organizational justice and teachers' performance. The results from Hayes process model revealed that the organizational justice fully mediated the relationship between the teachers' performance and organizational culture. Consequently, from mediation results, the decision about H4 is accepted based upon mediation results. Therefore, the present study provides significant information to offer the conclusion of this study and to offer certain recommendations for the management of higher education institutions for revisiting their policies concerning the research issues under considerations in the present research study.

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS

The organizational justice is important for nurturing the teachers' behavior towards the institutional prolonged and leading objectives. The institutions are therefore required to implement strategies that are critical for ensuring the fair procedures, just distributions and impartial interactions so that the teachers may be expected to show the higher performances.

- The performance is the critical phenomenon that is squarely anchored with the different parameters those which have been investigated in this research. The institutions are required to take suitable measures to inspire their teachers to show the respectable performance to upbring standards at par to required level to develop consequences for institutional success.
- The institutions may be benefited from results of current study by implementing suitable measures developing the strong culture for institutions based upon values of teachers and institutions. Institution management can obtain insights about teachers' motivations and inspiration towards decent and respectable performances.
- The institutional management can be benefited from conclusion of this study by extracting the information about the fair procedures, just distribution and impartial interactions. This may inspire the teachers in shaping their behavior as per required standards wherein institutional management can get practical guidelines from study results.

REFERENCES

- 1. Akhter, I., & Sharif, M. H. (2012). In search of academic excellence by becoming an effective leader: A study of academic leadership in higher education. Global Journal of Management and Business Research, 12 (10).
- 2. Ali, H. M., & Musah, M. B. (2012). Investigation of Malaysian higher education quality culture and workforce performance. Quality Assurance in Education, 20 (3), 289–309.
- 3. Arman, H., Latif, L. A., & Ali, J. (2014). Organizational Justice as a predictor of self-perceived work performance: A perspective from the Malaysian higher educational institution. Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences, 5 (23), 319-325.
- 4. Aryee, S., Chen, Z. X., & Budhwar, P. S. (2004). Exchange fairness and employee performance: an examination of the relationship between organizational politics and procedural justice. Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes, 94, 1-14.
- 5. Azizi, N., Mohammad, S., & Hassani, M. (2011). Organizational Political Tactics in Universities. Higher Education Studies, 1 (2), 65-72.
- 6. Bhawna, C., & Hatwal, V. (2018). A Study of Performance Management System in Higher Education Institution with Special Reference to Academicians. Journal of Emerging Technologies and Innovative Research, 5 (6), 350-353.
- 7. Cheng, Y., & Chia, N. (2017). Organizational Justice in Higher Education: Perceptions of Taiwanese Professors and Staffs. Contemporary Issues in Education Research, 10 (4), 231-239.
- 8. Cremer, D., Dijke, M., & Bos, A. E. (2007). When leaders are seen as transformational: The effects of organizational justice. Journal of Applied Social Psychology, 37, 1797-1816.
- 9. Creswell, J. W. (2007). Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches. London: Sage Publication.
- 10. Devonish, D., & Greenidge, D. (2010). The effect of organizational justice on contextual performance, counterproductive work behaviors and task performance: Investigating the moderating role of ability based emotional intelligence. International Journal of Selection and Assessment, 18, 1, 76-86.
- 11. Douglas, F. H., & Haley, L. M. (2013). Distributive justice in human resources management: A multisystem approach. The journal of American business review, 2 (1), 50-57.
- 12. Eberlin, R. J., & Tatum, B. C. (2008). Making just decisions: Organizational justice, decision making and leadership. Management Decision, 46 (2), 310-329.
- 13. Haider, Z., & Sultan, S. (2008). Challenges in higher education: Special reference to Pakistan and South Asian developing countries. Nonpartisan Educational Review, 4, 1–12.
- 14. Harris, R. B., Harris, K. J., & Harvey, P. (2007). A Test of Competing Models of the Relationships among Perceptions of Organizational Politics, Perceived Organizational Support, and Individual Outcomes. The Journal of Social Psychology, 147, 631-656.
- 15. Hassan, A., & Hashim, J. (2011). Role of organizational justice in determining work outcomes of national and expatriate academic staff in Malaysia. International Journal of Commerce and Management, 21 (1), 82 93.
- 16. Hassan, L., Kiani, Y., & Mohammad, E. (2015). The relationship between transformative leadership styles with organizational Justice. Advanced Social Humanities and Management, 2 (2), 64-70.
- 17. Hochwarter, W. A., Rosen, C. C., Jordan, S. L., Ferris, G. R., Ejaz, A., & Maher, L. P. (2020). Perceptions of Organizational Politics Research: Past, Present, and Future. Journal of Management, 014920631989850.
- 18. Hochwarter, W., & Thompson, K. (2010). The moderating role of optimism on politics-outcomes relationships: A test of competing perspectives. Human Relations, 63, 1-24.

- 19. Hossein, S., & Hassan, S. (2019). The moderating role of organizational politics perception in the relationship between organizational justice and job satisfaction. Academy of Strategic Management Journal, 18 (1).
- 20. Imran, K., Iqbal, J., Aslam, U., & Muqadas, F. (2018). Organizational politics and performance outcomes: investigating the buffering effect of organizational justice. Pakistan Business Review, 20 (1), 47-58.
- 21. Kalay, F., & Turkey, V. (2016). The Impact of Organizational Justice on Employee Performance: A Survey in Turkey and Turkish Context. International Journal of Human Resource Studies, 6 (1), 1-20.
- 22. Kaya, N., Aydin, S., & Ongun, G. (2016). The impacts of servant leadership and organizational politics on burnout: A research among mid-level managers. International Journal of Business Administration, 7(2), 26–32.
- 23. Khan, K., Abbas, M., Gul, A., & Raja, U. (2015). Organizational justice and job outcomes: Moderating role of islamic work ethic. Journal of Business Ethics, 126, 235–246.
- 24. Khan, Q., Shukor, A., & Ismail, S. S. (2016). Career Success and Organizational Justice as the Potential Predictors of Perceived University Performance: A Study from Public Sector Universities of Pakistan. International Journal of Economics & Management Sciences, 5:4, 1-6.
- 25. Khuwaja, U., Ahmed, D. K., Abid, G., & Adeel, A. (2020). Leadership and employee attitudes: The mediating role of perception of organizational politics. Cogent Business & Management, 10(2).
- 26. Lampaki, A., & Papadakis, V. 2018. The impact of organisational politics and trust in the top management team on strategic decision implementation success: A middle manager's perspective. European Management Journal, 36: 627-637.
- 27. Mace, J., & Niazi, H. (2006). The contribution of the private sector to higher education in Pakistan with particular reference to efficiency and equity. Bulletin of Education & Research, 28 (2), 17–42.
- 28. Markos, T., Sang, G., & Muthanna, A. (2019). Organizational culture and its influence on the performance of higher education institutions. International Journal of Research Studies in Education, 8 (2), 77-90.
- 29. Ogbonna, E., & Harris, L. (2005). Leadership style, organizational culture and performance: empirical evidence from UK Companies. International Journal of Human Resource Management, 11 (4), 766-788
- 30. Oluseyi, A., & Ayo, H. T. (2009). Influence of work motivation, leadership effectiveness and time management on employees' performance in some selected industries in Ibadan, Oyo State, Nigeria. European Journal of Economics, Finance and Administrative Sciences, (16).
- 31. Othman, N., Mokhtar, S. S. M., & Asaad, M. N. M. (2017). Quality Management System, Employee Satisfaction and Employee Performance in Private Higher Education Institutions: A Proposed Framework. International Journal of Management Research and Reviews, 7(6), 681.
- 32. Paracha, M. U., Qamar, A., Mirza, A., & Waqas, I. (2012). Impact of Leadership Style (Transformational and Transactional Leadership) on Employee Performance. Global Journal of Management and Business Research, 12 (4): 1.0.
- 33. Samuel, A., Xiong, C., and Budhwar, P. (2004). Exchange Fairness and Employee Performance: An examination of the relationship between organizational politics and Procedural Justice"; Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes, 94-1-14.
- 34. Tahseen, N., & Akhtar, M. S. (2015). Effect of Organizational Justice on Faculty Trust in University Education Faculties. Journal of Research and Reflections in Education, 9 (1), 26-41.
- 35. Thornton, C. H., & Audrey, J. (2008). The role of culture in institutional and individual approaches to civic responsibility at research universities. The Journal of Higher Education, 79 (2), 160-182.
- 36. Walker, M., & Boni, A. (2014). Higher education and human development. Towards the public and social good. In A. Boni & M. Walker (Eds.), Human development and capabilities.
- 37. Wang, X., Liao J., Xia D., & Chang T. (2010). The impact of organizational justice on work performance mediating effects of organizational commitment and leader-member exchange. International Journal of Manpower, 31(6), 660-677.
- 38. Yielder, J., & Codling, A. (2004). Management and leadership in the university. Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management, 26 (3), 315-28.